

APRIL 23, 2008 PAR AD HOC TASK FORCE COMMENTS ON PROPOSED SFTEP CHANGES TO MUNI SERVICES IN RICHMOND DISTRICT

Background– At its March 3, 2008 the Board of Directors of the Planning Association of the Richmond District (PAR) received its first presentation on the Municipal Transportation Agency’s San Francisco Transit Effectiveness Project (SFTEP) and the proposed changes to MUNI services in the Richmond District. The PAR Board was orally advised by MTA staff, Julie Kirschenbaum, Project Manager, and Peter Straus, Director of Strategic Planning that public comment will be invited on SFTEP through mid May 2008 at scheduled public meetings; SFTEP will be presented to the MTA Board in June 2008 for approval in concept; and MTA will make the final decision on SFTEP. After environmental review, implementation of SFTEP would be in July 2009 . Per MTA staff, the Office of the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors can only approve or disapprove the entire SFTEP plan.

Given the brief remaining public comment period, the PAR Board asked that a MTA staff presentation be made to its membership at the April 23, 2008 general membership meeting and appointed an ad hoc task force of Board members to review the SFTEP’s proposed changes to Richmond District services. Task Force members Gene Brodsky, Julie Burns, Raymond Holland, Paul Rosenberg and Maria Sousa reviewed the information available at the SFTEP website, www.sfteped.com. At the PAR Board’s April 7 meeting the task force presented comments – primarily based on the summary of Paul Rosenberg (see below). Additional comments were then invited from other PAR Board members.

The following narrative is a summary of comments by individual task force members as well as other PAR Board members. Comments are based on review of information available at www.sfteped.com and Paul Rosenberg’s summary. Given the brief period for review by PAR Board members (all of whom are volunteers) of only the information available at the sfteped website, we wish to clearly state that these comments are not a comprehensive analysis of SFTEP and are not a final policy statement by the PAR Board on SFTEP. There may be other information, reports, data available from the MTA that would respond to these initial comments. Hopefully we will receive the responses at tonight’s general membership meeting or in the following weeks. After tonight’s general membership meeting, we invite PAR members to provide additional comments to the Ad hoc task force members and to also attend the remaining SFTEP public meetings.

Introduction

We commend the MTA for creation of the SFTEP website, www.sfteped.com, and the wealth of information available at that site. We found that the website best serves an enquirer seeking information about a specific MUNI line or a few lines. The information regarding proposed changes is organized by supervisorial district. As our neighborhood encompasses two separate districts and Richmond residents use lines – especially East/West direction lines – that cross multiple districts, determining the specific changes/effects to a Richmond district resident’s present MUNI line route was time consuming. Information provided for each line is understandably brief and resulted in several questions that would requiring additional review and/or information from MTA staff. Comments are organized by Muni line and as they include all comments from several PAR Board members, some of which are not in agreement about a specific change, we emphasize again that this comment document is not a final PAR Board statement.

Comments: Changes to MUNI Lines in the Richmond District

In reviewing the changes to service in both Districts 1 and 2, generally it appears that west/east and vice versa services in District 1 will be reduced – especially in the northern part of the Richmond -- and services in District 2 will be increased. While some PAR Board members commented that SFTEP changes must require compromises – some would benefit and others not, other PAR Board members commented that it is not clear and convincing that the segments of the Richmond that are losing service would be as well served by the alternatives. We applaud proposals to increase north/south and vice versa services, especially in the 28 and 9 lines. We support increased and improved services for the commute express services, AX and BX lines. But details re route changes and travel times were not available on the SFTEP website. As there will be no public hearings on SFTEP after mid-May 2008 and the Mayor’s Office and Board of Supervisors are not permitted to make changes to parts of SFTEP, we comment that there appears to be a great deal of decision making to be made solely by MTA staff that is presently unknown and would directly impact the entire Richmond District.

We have specific questions, recommendations and comments regarding the following:

2 Clement

- Service would be eliminated west of Park Presidio based on “low ridership”, but we question the conclusion that proposed changes to the 1, 38 and 18 lines would be a sufficient alternate service for Richmond district residents in the outer west and northern parts of our neighborhood. Per SFTEP, the 38 Geary La Playa service would be eliminated and the 1 California line would be extended to 33 Ave only during peak periods. The 18 line presently serves the CA Legion of Honor Museum from 5AM until 1AM the following morning daily – even though the Museum is only open to the public Tues-Sunday from 9:30AM-5:15PM. An alternative consideration should be to reduce services on the 18 route to the Legion of Honor to only 8 AM-6PM or elimination altogether of the 18 route to the Legion of Honor. Continuation and extension of the 2 Clement which presently runs until 8 in the evening would be more logical to serve the Legion. The 18 line could go to 48th Ave and Point Lobos and the 2 along Clement to 34th Ave and then to the California Legion of Honor. Would elimination of the present empty runs by the 18 line to the Legion realize comparable savings that SFTEP is projecting for elimination of the 2 line West of Park Presidio?
- SFTEP proposes that present lines 3 and 4 would be consolidated into the future 2 Clement route resulting in additional services for District 2 residents, which we applaud. But several PAR Board members question the basis for rerouting the 2 Clement line at Arguello to Geary Boulevard until Presidio Avenue. The present route of the 2 Clement between Arguello and Presidio provides Richmond residents services to the California St. Campuses of CA Pacific Medical Center as well as to the Laurel HTS shopping district and the Jewish Community Center. In addition, present users of the 2, 3 and 4 lines for the Suttercan now easily transfer at Arguello and California to the 1 California.

1, 31 and 38 AX and BX

- 1AX route neighborhood stops would be extended to Arguello and 1BX would commence at Arguello. While this increases and improves services for some residents of District 2, we assume that the travel time for users of 1AX will be increased.
- Increased 31 BX frequency should be matched by increased 38AX frequency as it is proposed that the 31 Balboa will replace 38 Geary La Playa service.
- All X lines would now stop at Van Ness per SFTEP to serve riders to Civic Center. While we presume there is SFTEP data supporting a need for express service for District 1 and 2 residents to Civic Center, we have not seen the data. While a PAR Board member assumed that the X line Van Ness stops would also serve Richmond District residents who work in SOMA, We question the efficacy of all X lines stopping at Van Ness as those stops would be at Bush and Van Ness and riders to Civic Center would still have to transfer to Van Ness lines. Would the increased 5L and 38L services provide a more efficient alternative? Secondly, a Van Ness stop for all X lines would presumably lengthen the travel time for all X riders and further lengthen the travel time for present 1AX users.

18 - 46th Ave

- Service to the Cliff House area would be eliminated. Route would be changed to serve eliminated 38 Geary Ocean Beach branch. See comments at 2 Clement above and below 38 Geary section.

28, 28L and 29

- lines would eliminate service to Golden Gate Bridge. SFTEP proposes that 28L and 29 would not serve the Golden Gate Bridge; service to the Toll Plaza would continue to be provided by PresidiGo Shuttle and Golden Gate Transit (GGT), with connection to GGT buses provided at Richardson/Francisco.

38 Geary and 38L Geary

- We heartily support the increased service period for the 38L to 6am-10PM. We believe this extension of service is overdue and would serve not only residents of District 1 and 2 but also residents of other districts.
- SFTEP proposes to eliminate **38 Geary** branch to Ocean Beach with alternate service by new 18 route. That segment of Balboa-Cabrillo is presently well served by the 31 – which SFTEP will not change.
- SFTEP states that changes to 38 and 38L will be coordinated with Geary BRT. We question what “coordination” will entail as SFTEP will be implemented as soon as July 2009 and PAR has previously commented that before Geary BRT dedicated bus lanes options are adopted other practices to improve 38 Geary service should be adopted and implemented.

Comments re Elimination of Service to Cliff House Area and to GG Bridge Toll Plaza.

Several PAR Board members support the elimination of these stops and services as they believe they are used almost solely by out of town tourists and the priority for MUNI service resources should be directed to SF residents -- especially if these resources will be redirected by SFTEP to improved 28 and 29 services. Other Board members commented that elimination of MUNI service to the Cliff House area and GG Bridge would be a disservice to the Richmond and other city residents and school groups. Specific comments are:

- PresidioGo Shuttle and GGT are not a good alternative for SF residents who work in the Presidio as well as Presidio residents and for lower income residents of the Richmond who either work in the Presidio or travel to Marin. PresidioGo Shuttle service is provided only during daylight hours and is infrequent.
- Direct service should be provided to the Cliff House/Lands End trail head (part of the California Coastal Trail <http://www.californiacoastaltrail.info/cms/pages/main/index.html>), and to the new National Park Visitors Center at Merrie Way -- especially in supporting "transit first" alternatives (vs. driving to trail head or Cliff House). Road safety on Point Lobos is an issue, compounded by the reconfiguration of the parking and Merrie Way access and the proposed bicycle lane along Point Lobos. Would MTA consider weekend transit service to these destinations?

General Comments/Suggestions re MUNI service

- To promote bus rider safety and ultimately to promote efficiency, cameras should be installed on all buses
- Traffic lights should be coordinated on all routes (not just Geary);
- Efficiency will be most improved by negotiating MUNI union contracts that remove any allowance for driver failure to show up for work and if MUNI drivers would uniformly follow basic mandate to pull into bus stops so that the bus does not block the right-hand lane, which not only slows cars but slows other buses as well.
- the present bus bulbs or protrusions of the curblines out to the traffic lane allow MUNI buses to stop and drop/pick up passengers in a traffic lane -- blocking traffic. This seems like well-intended planning that creates unnecessary traffic congestion and frustration, including causing other buses to get blocked. Muni should seek in the alternative passage of a traffic law that gives MUNI buses the right of way in re-entering the traffic lane. Once the law is passed, the existing islands ought to be removed. Negative incentives, that is, designs that are hostile to non-MUNI vehicles and cause other drivers to get so frustrated that they supposedly will give up driving and instead ride the MUNI, is a very poor concept. The focus should be on positive solutions.

April 3, 2008 – PAR Summary of SFTEP changes to MUNI services in Districts 1 & 2 – Drafted by PAR Board member, Paul Rosenberg from text on SFTEP website.

District 1 (includes the Inner & Outer Richmond District and Golden Gate Park):

1-California would be improved with extra service to 33rd Avenue during peak hours.

New 5-Fulton limited service would be provided between 6th Avenue and Van Ness during peak hours, with service to the Transbay Terminal at all times.

28L-19th Avenue Limited would extend through the Marina to Van Ness Ave. and to Balboa Park BART and Mission St. enhanced resource scenario could extend further to Visitacion Valley)

38L-Geary Limited would run more often, later, and on Sundays; (All Richmond expresses 1, 31 and 38 AX and BX would also stop at Van Ness Ave.)

38-Geary La Playa branch would be replaced by rerouted 18-46th Avenue.

Portions of routes would be discontinued: 2-Clement (west of Park Presidio), **18-46th Avenue** (on Point Lobos) and **28-19th Avenue** and **29-Sunset** (to the Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza)

District 2 (includes the Marina, Cow Hollow, Pacific Heights, Sea Cliff, Presidio Heights, and Laurel Village):

Increased frequency would be provided on several routes including more peak service on the 1-California and 22-Fillmore

24-Divisadero would be extended to the Marina. Improved connections would be provided to SOMA, Potrero and other eastern neighborhoods served by 12, 27, and 45-lines.

30-Stockton would use only 60' articulated buses, and could be extended to the Presidio in the enhanced resource scenario.

28-19th Ave in the Marina would be replaced by an extension of the 28L-19th Ave Limited to Van Ness (43-Masonic would serve Fort Mason)

New Downtown Circulator (modified 19-Polk) would be created to improve travel options in the urban core); 20-Columbus would be incorporated into new Downtown Circulator (modified 19-Polk)

Portions of 41-Union west of Fillmore, and **28-19th Avenue** and **29-Sunset** service to the Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza **would be discontinued**

3-Jackson would be discontinued (strong service would remain on Sutter/Post)

Summary of Proposed 1-California Changes:

More frequent service proposed during peak hours between Presidio Ave. and 33rd Ave. Route would stop north of Market at California/Drumm (currently some peak period service extends to Main/Beale). Would consolidate peak-hour "short line" at Presidio Ave. (rather than Fillmore St. and 6th Ave.) Proposed frequencies (east of Presidio Ave.) - 3 min peaks; 6 min midday. Proposed frequencies (west of Presidio Ave.) - 6 min peaks; 6 min midday

Summary of Proposed 1AX -California "A" Express Changes:

Would be upgraded to 60' articulated buses and extended to pick up passengers between Park Presidio and Arguello (currently served by the 1BX). Would have more frequent PM peak service. Stop would be added at Van Ness Ave. Proposed changes would reduce crowding, shorten wait times, and improve connections to Civic Center. Proposed frequencies - 10 min AM peak; 12 min PM peak.

Summary of Proposed 1BX-California "B" Express Changes:

The 1BX would begin at Arguello and the segment between Park Presidio and Arguello (currently served by the 1BX) would be picked up by the 1AX. More frequent PM peak service. Stop would be added at Van Ness Ave. These changes would reduce crowding, shorten wait times, and improve connections to Civic Center. Proposed frequencies - 6 min AM peak; 12 min PM peak.

Summary of Proposed 2-Clement Changes:

Sutter Street lines (2, 3, and 4) would be consolidated into the 2-Clement. More frequent service proposed on Sutter to reduce crowding and shorten wait times. Service west of 14th Ave. would be discontinued due to low ridership and access to high quality service one block away (1-California and 38-Geary). Between Arguello and Presidio Avenues, the 2-Clement would be rerouted from California St. to Geary Blvd. Proposed frequencies (east of Presidio Ave) - 3 min peaks; 10 min midday. Proposed frequencies (west of Presidio Ave) - 6 min peaks; 20 min midday

Summary of Proposed 3-Jackson Changes:

Sutter Street lines (2, 3, and 4) would be consolidated into the 2-Clement; 3-Jackson and 4-Sutter would be discontinued as separate routes. More frequent service proposed on Sutter to reduce crowding and shorten wait times. Jackson branch would be eliminated due to low ridership. Lines 2 (except for west of Park Presidio), 12, 22 and 43 would continue to offer service along virtually its entire route. 2-Clement proposed frequencies (on Sutter) - 3 min peaks; 10 min midday

Summary of Proposed 4-line Changes:

Sutter Street lines (2, 3, and 4) would be consolidated into the 2-Clement; 3-Jackson, and 4-Sutter would be discontinued as separate routes. More frequent service proposed on Sutter to reduce crowding and shorten wait times. 2-Clement proposed frequencies (on Sutter) - 3 min peaks; 10 min midday.

Summary of Proposed 5/5L-Fulton Changes:

Two service types proposed for peak periods:

Long-line "5L" would make local stops west of 6th Ave. and limited stops between 6th Ave. and Van Ness, decreasing travel time for most passengers. Short-line "5" from 6th Ave. to Downtown would provide additional, local service in Western Addition to address high peak ridership and crowding. Non-peak service would make local stops from the ocean to Downtown. Would go to downtown at all times, rather than turning back at Civic Center in

the evening. Proposed frequencies (east of 6th Ave.) - 4 min peaks; 7.5 min midday.
Proposed frequencies (west of 6th Ave.) - 7.5 min peaks; 7.5 min midday

Summary of Proposed 18-46th Ave. Changes:

Would be combined with 23-Monterey to create a continuous line from the Palace of the Legion of Honor to the Bayview. Would provide direct connection from Outer Sunset to southern part of City and Glen Park BART. Would be rerouted onto 33rd Ave. to Balboa and Cabrillo streets, replacing Ocean Beach branch of 38-line and providing outer Balboa St. with direct connections to the Sunset. 17-line would replace service around Lake Merced. Segment on Geary Blvd/Point Lobos would be discontinued, the Cliff House would still be within walking distance of the 38L-Geary Limited. Proposed frequencies - 15 min peak; 20 min all day.

Summary of Proposed 21-Hayes Changes:

Would no longer operate west of Stanyan St. to reduce duplication with 5-Fulton. Two-way service on lower Hayes proposed (additional study needed). More frequent service during peaks would shorten wait times and reduce crowding. Proposed frequencies - 6 min AM peak; 12 min midday.

Summary of Proposed 28-19th Ave. Changes:

More frequent service would shorten wait times and reduce crowding. Would terminate at California St. during most hours, with service to Marina provided by 28L. Late night and OWL coverage of Marina would be provided by 28 when 28L is not running. Proposed frequency - 7.5 min peaks; 10 min midday.

Summary of Proposed 28L-19th Ave. Limited Changes:

Would have rapid, very limited-stop service, increasing access to SFSU and southern entrance of City College from Marina, Richmond, Sunset, and Excelsior. Route would be extended to Van Ness/North Point via Lombard St. and to Mission/Geneva via I-280. To improve travel time and reliability, the 28L would not serve the Golden Gate Bridge; service to the Toll Plaza would continue to be provided by PresidiGo Shuttle and Golden Gate Transit (GGT), with connection to GGT buses provided at Richardson/Francisco. In Enhanced Scenario, the 28L could be extended to Visitación Valley, Bayshore Caltrain Station and the T-line. Proposed frequency - 10 min all day

Summary of Proposed 31-Balboa Changes:

No route or frequency changes proposed. Proposed frequency - 10 min peak; 15 min midday

Summary of Proposed 31-AX Balboa "A" Express Changes:

Stop would be added at Van Ness Ave. to improve access to Civic Center. Proposed frequency - 7.5 min AM peak; 10 min PM peak.

Summary of Proposed 31-BX Balboa "B" Express Changes:

More frequent PM peak service would reduce crowding and shorten wait times. Stop would be added at Van Ness Ave. to improve access to Civic Center. Proposed frequency - 10 min AM peak; 12 min PM peak

Summary of Proposed 33-Stanyan Changes-Alternative A:

Alternative A and B would have different routes south of Market St. Southern portion would be rerouted to intersect Castro Metro Station and provide service along existing 24-line to 3rd St./ Palou via Castro, Noe, Cortland, Industrial and Palou. Service on 18th St. would be picked up by extending 37-Corbett to 16th St. BART; connections to SF General Hospital would be provided by rerouted 24-line. No route change proposed north of Market. Proposed frequencies - 15 min all day.

Summary of Proposed 33-Stanyan Changes- Alternative B:

Alternative A and B would have different routes south of Market St. Would operate on current route west of Potrero Ave. Would cross Potrero Ave and continue on 16th St./Connecticut /18th St. to cover the segment currently served by the 22-Fillmore on Potrero Hill. Proposed frequencies - 15 min all day.

Summary of Proposed 38-Geary Changes:

Geary Blvd would retain existing frequency of the 38-local, in addition to increased 38L frequencies. Branch to Ocean Beach would be discontinued, and replaced by rerouted 18-46th Ave. Buses would go to Fort Miley for most of the day, and would go to 48th Ave./Point Lobos during late night when 38L is not running. Would coordinate with Geary Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) Study currently underway which aims to achieve significant travel time and reliability improvements. Proposed frequencies (east of 33rd Ave.) - 7.5 min AM Peak; 6 min PM Peak; 12 min midday. Proposed frequencies (west of 33rd Ave.) - 15 min AM Peak; 12 min PM Peak; 15 min midday

Summary of Proposed 38-L Geary Limited Changes:

Service hours would be expanded to operate between 6 AM and 10 PM, 7 days a week. Service frequency would be increased to reduce crowding and shorten wait times. Would coordinate with Geary Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) Study currently underway which aims to achieve significant travel time and reliability improvements. No route changes proposed. Proposed frequency - 5 min all day

Summary of Proposed 38AX Geary "A" Express Changes:

Stop would be added at Van Ness Ave. to improve connections to Civic Center. Proposed frequency - 10 min AM peak; 15 min PM peak.

Summary of Proposed 38BX Geary "B" Express Changes:

Stop would be added at Van Ness Ave. to improve connections to Civic Center. Proposed frequency - 7.5 min AM peak; 15 min PM peak.

Summary of Proposed 43-Masonic Changes:

Would be extended from Chestnut/Fillmore to Fort Mason (Marina Blvd/Laguna), replacing the 28-line terminal. Proposed frequency -10 min peak; 12 min midday

Summary of Proposed 44-O'Shaughnessy Changes:

No route changes proposed. More frequent service will reduce crowding and shorten wait times. Proposed frequency - 9 min peaks; 12 min midday.